BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 04863 9736

FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

Volume II
(revised)

Brenda Cossman, Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

2002-2003

Prepared with the assistance of Andrea Sanche

* * *

These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
JAN - 8
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

Volume II
(revised)

Brenda Cossman, Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

2002-2003

Prepared with the assistance of Andrea Sanche

* * *

These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/familylawcasesma02coss_8

FAMILY LAW

Table of Contents

Volume II

Page No.

V. MATRIMONIAL PROPERTY

A. Historical Overview

(a) Common Law

OLRC, *Report on Family Law, Part IV: Family Property* 253

(b) Trust Doctrine

LRCC, *Family Property* 256
Note: *Murdoch v. Murdoch* and *Rathwell v. Rathwell* 258
Pettkus v. Becker 261
Globe and Mail, "Woman's Suicide Ends Fight for Rights" 269
Globe and Mail, "Ontario Fee System Cited in Woman's Legal Woe" 270
Globe and Mail, "Payout ends tragic story of farm wife's legal battle" 271
Note: *Sorochan v. Sorochan* 272
Peter v. Beblow 274
Note: Recent Cases on Constructive Trust 290
Harrison v. Kalinocha 291
Crick v. Ludwig 293
Note: *Bell v. Bailey* 299
Nowell v. Town Estate (Ont. Gen. Div.) 300
Nowell v. Town Estate (Ont. C.A.) 306
Note: Legislative Reform of the Property Rights of Unmarried Cohabitants 307
Walsh v. Bona 307
Note: Legislative Reform of the Property Rights of Unmarried Cohabitants (cont'd) 319

(c) Statutory Reform

Holland, "Reform of Matrimonial Property Law in Ontario" 321
Wolfson, *The New Family Law Act* 322

B. The Family Law Act, 1986

(a) The Partnership Principle

Knetsch, "Some Economic Implications of Matrimonial Property Rules" 326
Prager, "Shifting Perspectives on Marital Property Law" 333

Eekelaar, *Family Law and Social Policy*, "Adjustment on Divorce" 337
Fineman, "Implementing Equality" 339
Note: Application of Matrimonial Property Law to Aboriginal Women 343

(b) Overview of the Family Law Act

Ontario Law Reform Commission, *Report on Family Property* (1993) 345
Law Reform Commission of British Columbia, *Working Paper on Property Rights on Marriage Breakdown* (1989) 348

(c) Applying the FLA: Calculating the Equalization Payment

Goodman, "Matrimonial Property", *Family Law* Bar Admission Course Materials 353
Skrlj v. Skrlj 366
Hovius, Sample Problems 369

(d) Valuation and Valuation Date Assets

(i) Valuation Date

Note 371

(ii) Determining Ownership of Assets

Fredricks, "The Ownership Conundrum" 373
Wolfson and Corbin, "Problems of Title and and Constructive Trusts" 374

(iii) Valuation

Hovius and Youdan, The Law of Family Property 376
Black v. Black 379
Goodman, "Matrimonial Property", *Family Law* Bar Admission Course Materials 381

(e) Deductions and Exclusions

Hovius and Youdan, The Law of Family Property 383
Folga v. Folga 387
Note: *Nahatchewitz v. Nahatchewitz* 389
Black v. Black 390
Note: Proposed Amendments to the *Family Law Act* 392

(f) The Definition of Property: Professional Degrees and Earning Capacity

Caratun v. Caratun 395
Note: The Trial Judgment in *Caratun* 401
Note: Compensatory Support 403

(g) **Continued Relevance of Constructive Trust**

Kelly v. Kelly 405

Rawluk v. Rawluk 406
Note: Reverse Constructive Trust 419
Note: OLRC 1993 Recommendations 421

(h) Departures from Equal Sharing

(i) Short Marriage

Futia v.Futia 422
Pope v. Pope 424

(ii) Depletion of Assets

Scott v. Scott 427
Notes 430

(iii) Unequal Contributions

LeBlanc v. LeBlanc 433
Toronto Star, "A New Day in a Hard Life" 437
Berdette v. Berdette 439
Note: *Peake v. Peake* and *McInnis v. McInnis* 444
Brett v. Brett 445
Note: Tort Awards for Spousal Misconduct 449

(iv) Post-Separation Conduct and Anticipated Future Needs 449

(v) Reform of s. 5(6)

Note: OLRC 1993 Recommendations 452

VI. THE MATRIMONIAL HOME

A. Introduction

Hovius, "The Matrimonial Home" 457

B. Overview of Part II of the Family Law Act, 1986

Wolfson and Corbin, "The Matrimonial Home Under the FLA" 458

C. Orders for Exclusive Possession

Bissett-Johnson and Holland, *Matrimonial Property Law in Canada* 463
Pifer v. Pifer 464
Note: *Bailey v. Bailey* 465
Hill v. Hill 466
Note: Exclusive Possession and Issues of Violence 470
Note: Restraining Orders 472

D. Groups Precluded from Protection

Note 472
Gathering Strength: Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples 474

VII. SPOUSAL SUPPORT

A. The Principles of Spousal Support

(a) The Historical Basis of Spousal Support

Eekelaar and Maclean, *Maintenance After Divorce* 478

(b) Modern Spousal Support Law—The Search for New Principles

Eekelaar and Maclean, "The Evolution of Private Law Maintenance Obligations" 479
LRCC, *Maintenance on Divorce* 480
Rogerson, "Spousal Support After *Moge*" 483
Rogerson, "The Causal Connection Test in Spousal Support Law" 485

B. Spousal Support Under the *Divorce Act, 1985*

(a) Some Preliminary Issues of Jurisdiction and Standing

Note 491

(a) The Rise of the Clean Break Principle and the Causal Connection Test

Rogerson, "Spousal Support After *Moge*" 493
Messier v. Delage 494
Note: The Supreme Court of Canada "Trilogy" 497
Pelech v. *Pelech* 497
Richardson v. Richardson 508

(c) The Law Shifts: *Moge v. Moge*

Moge v. Moge 516

(d) Implementing the *Moge* Compensatory Principle

Rogerson, "Spousal Support Post-*Bracklow*" 534
Elliot v. Elliot 535
Ross v. Ross 546
Note: *MacNeil v. MacNeil* 550
Leek v. Lightfoot 551
Morison v. Morison 553

(e) The Pendulum Swings Again: *Bracklow v. Bracklow* and Needs-Based Support

Rogerson, "Spousal Support Post-*Bracklow*" 557

Bracklow v. Bracklow 558
Rogerson, "Spousal Support Post-*Bracklow*" 571

(f) The Interaction of Spousal Support and Child Support; Spousal Support and the Post-Divorce Care of Children

Rogerson, "Spousal Support Post-*Bracklow*" 576
Bildy v. Bildy 576
Andrews v. Andrews 579

VIII. DOMESTIC CONTRACTS

A. Introduction: Contracting in the Family Context

Balfour v. Balfour 585
Harper's Magazine, "Conditional Love" 585
O'Donovan, "Reforming the Private" from *Sexual Divisions in Law* 586
Mnookin, "Divorce Bargaining: the Limits on Private Ordering" 589
Bailey, "*Pelch, Caron, and Richardson*" 593
Note: The *Pelech* Trilogy 593

B. Limits on Contracting

(a) Setting Aside Contracts: General Principles of Contract Law

Hovius, *Family Law* 595
Note: Unconscionability 596
Hyldtoft v. Hyldtoft 596
Puopolo v. Puopolo 597
Lindsay v. Lindsay 599
Crouse v. Crouse 604
Rosen v. Rosen 608
Slate v. Slate 610
Majury, "Unconscionability in an Equality Context" 612
Leopold v. Leopold 614

(b) Statutory Powers to Set Aside and Vary: Spousal Support

Introductory Note 624
Cossman, "A Matter of Difference: Domestic Contracts and Gender Equality" 625
Bailey, "*Pelech, Richardson and Caron*" 626
G. (L). v. B. (G). 626
Santosuosso v. Santosuosso 633
Larocque v. Larocque 639
Miglin v. Miglin 644